

COMMITTEE FOR LINGUISTICS IN EDUCATION

Website: <http://www.phon.ucl.ac.uk/home/dick/ec/clietop.htm>

MINUTES OF MEETING 78

Wednesday 3 November 2004

The Institute of Education, University of London

1. PRESENT: Richard Aplin (ALA), Sue Barry (LAGB), Eve Bearne (UKLA), Jill Bourne (Secretary) (BAAL), Jeff Branch (English Association), Billy Clark (LAGB), Keith Davidson (NATE), Charlotte Franson (NALDIC), Dick Hudson (Chair) (LAGB), Tim Shortis (Co-opted), Mahendra Verma (Co-opted), Brian Street (Co-opted)

APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE: Jo Arthur, Keith Brown, Celine Castelino, Geoff Dean, Terry Lamb, Rob Penman, Catherine Walter

2. Minutes of Last Meeting.

Correction – add date of November meeting. Minutes agreed.

3. Matters arising

It was agreed that the CLIE website address should be included at top of each copy of Minutes.

CILT still to be invited to send a representative to CLIE

JB

BAAL – to be contacted to request replacement of Janet Maybin on CLIE

JB

Terms of reference Paragraph 2b: Agreed that remit should include language in HE. The intention is to interpret 'school curriculum' broadly to include all education. It was agreed not to change Terms of Reference at present, but to change wording at next revision to clarify this.

4. Reports from CLIE Representatives at other meetings

Billy Clark & Dick Hudson were attending a meeting on English at QCA later in November.

There was to be a Language Alliance meeting also in November (if Dick Hudson cannot attend, Richard Aplin will represent CLIE).

5. Activity Reports

NATE report attached, with a supplementary report on a meeting of the English Reform Group.

UKLA report attached

ALL report attached

NALDIC: Annual conference, 20th November 2004, 'Speaking and Listening' with Meryl Swain

It was agreed that the Secretary would send out a reminder for reports with the request for Agenda items, reports would then be sent out with the Agenda before the meeting.

JB

6. Dates of Meetings in 2005/6

Agreed: 2nd November 2005

15th February 2006

24th May 2006

7. Speakers at Next Meeting

16 February 2005: A QCA speaker on Tomlinson 14-19 if possible.

Alternatives included:

Community Languages – eg Angela Creese/Peter Martin)

The National Centre for Literacy/Numeracy/ESOL

Deborah Myhill (Exeter) or Sue Beverton (Durham) on Grammar for teaching of writing.

8. Discussion of the Tomlinson Report

A government statement was expected in January. There appeared to be a retreat by government on the Tomlinson proposals. It was thought that CLIE should take a pro-active approach, otherwise we would be 'on back foot' when the government reports. Members of CLIE had mixed views on the proposals. There appeared to be three views of English in the document: as English Language, as English Literature, and as basic key skills in communication. There was some recognition implied in the use of 'communications' of new modes and media studies. There were concerns expressed by some that "Communication" would be assessed externally on a mastery basis, offering a potentially restrictive 'apprenticeship' approach. It was thought that the status of "English" could decline into a small elite literary subject in the state school, for most reduced from inclusion of literature to a focus just on basic communication/skills. On the other hand, others welcomed the possibility of a separation between the studies of language and literature. Another concern was that, since people develop communication skills by doing things that matter to them and thus making meanings, mastery testing could lead to disaffection.

CLIE needed to consider in further discussions how this group intended feeding into this radical review of education. What do we want to do as a group over the next 2/3 years at this significant point?

9. AOB

- (1) It was questioned whether someone who has a degree in Linguistics would be seen by ITT providers as qualified to take up a PGCE in English. It was understood that there was no TTA regulation, but it was up to each ITT provider to decide if an applicant's qualifications were appropriate for them to undertake the course. Tim Shortis agreed to set up a sub-group to produce a pamphlet for admissions tutors, ITT English tutors and students.
- (2) Dick Hudson has now included a diary listing of relevant meetings in the UK on the CLIE webpage : <http://www.phon.ucl.ac.uk/home/dick/ec/cliectop.htm>
- (3) Catherine Walter was thanked for making refreshments available to the committee.

10. Presentation by Dr. Lid King, National Director for Languages, DfES: 'Language learning: a new paradigm – a personal view'. See Powerpoint slides (available via www.phon.ucl.ac.uk/home/dick/ec/cliemeetings.htm) for a summary.