

COMMITTEE FOR LINGUISTICS IN EDUCATION
Minutes of Meeting no. 54

Wednesday 13 November 1996
University of London Institute of Education

Present: Nicola Wood (Chair); Roz Ivanič (Secretary); Larry Trask (Treasurer - provisionally); Greg Brooks; Henrietta Dombey; Ali Houas; Ben Rampton; Joe Reynolds.

1. Apologies: Tom Bloor; Kersti Borjars; Charlotte Franson; George Keith; Jane Medwell; Ann Miller; Katharine Perera.

2. Minutes of Meeting 53 were approved with minor amendments.

3. Matters arising from the minutes

53.3: Ben Rampton is no longer editor of the BAAL Newsletter; please send any communication about Newsletter business to the Chairperson of BAAL: Ros Mitchell.

53.6: George Keith had suggested that Dick Hudson's paper 'What all Linguists Agree on' ⁽¹⁾ could be updated via a discussion at LAGB and / or at BAAL which would include, amongst other things, discussing assumptions about descriptivism.

ACTION: *Roz to attempt to schedule such a discussion at BAAL in Birmingham in Sept 1997, inviting Dick Hudson, Debbie Cameron and Ros Mitchell, among others, to participate.*

4. Dates of future meetings

5 Feb 1997 in London
9 June 1997 in London
10, 11 or 12 Sept 1997 in Birmingham at the BAAL AGM.

ACTION: *Roz to agree a date for the Sept meeting with the BAAL conference organiser.*

5. Exchange of information among committee members

5.1 *Roz:* the colloquium on Language and Education at the BAAL AGM in September, put together by Chris Brumfit and Gunther Kress; particularly a paper by Alison Sealey about views of language and views of childhood in the National curriculum for English

5.2 *Roz:* Lancaster's seminar on Multilingual Literacies organised by Marilyn Martin-Jones was held 14 - 16 November 1996. Will almost certainly lead to a publication. Contact Kathryn Jones for further information

5.3 *Ali:* the SCAA document: 'Monitoring the School Curriculum: Reporting to Schools', and particularly the worrying monolithic view of 'Standard English' it contains. We need to be aware that these sorts of views are being circulated, try to exert influence in this area, and

seek to encourage alternative research on the implementation of the National Curriculum for English.

- 5.4 *Discussion* of the value of communicating with SCAA and TTA: we decided we should invite their representatives to give us advance information about what they are doing, but not to be members of CLIE
ACTION: *Roz to invite a rep. of TTA to talk about the current consultations on the National Curriculum for Initial Teacher Training in English*
- 5.5 *Henrietta:* recommended the Literacy Centres' Syllabus for English, now operating in 13 English LEAs (? documentation?)
- 5.6 *Henrietta:* had attended a SCAA seminar on Geoff Williams' work in Sydney on explicit teaching about language from a systemic-functional grammar perspective
refs.: HASAN, R. and WILLIAMS, G. 1996 Literacy in Society. Longman.
WILLIAMS, G. (ed.) Ways of Saying, Ways of Meaning.
- 5.7 *Discussion:* Is explicit knowledge about language relevant just to teachers or for children too?
- 5.8 *Greg:* NFER, in response to 'a challenge' from UKRA, has commissioned John Mountford to write something informing teachers of reading and spelling of what they may need to know about 'the writing system'. Inevitably the main focus is on 'Southern Standard English'.
- 5.9 At a Royal Society debate 'Does Standard English Exist and Should it be Taught?' Main speakers were Dick Hudson and Jean Aitchison. Hudson was presenting the controversial view that there are very few differences between 'standard spoken English' and other varieties, so why shouldn't these differences be taught?
- 5.10 *Greg:* There are various people doing research on KAL: the Southampton project; Peggy Nastat (?in Oxford); NFER planning a project on what KAL primary teachers are teaching and what the uptake is.
- 5.11 *Ben:* TVU ESRC funded project on Multilingualism and Heteroglossia in and out of school.
- 5.12 *Larry:* still working on his Beginners' Grammar.
- 5.13 *Roz:* At Lancaster a Computer-based grammar tutorial for First Year undergrads, and perhaps suitable for teachers is in the process of development. More information from Tony McEnery (a.mcenery@lancs.ac.uk) or via Roz.
- 5.14 *Joe:* Speech therapists are doing more and more work talking to teachers about language issues (esp. spoken), rather than just supporting children with statements of Special Ed. needs. It's difficult for the two to find a common language about language, as they have such different professional training. This change is partly caused by the fact that spoken language used not to be part of the official curriculum, but now is.
- 5.15 *Ali:* OFSTED report by GILLBORN, D. AND GIPPS, C. 1996 Recent research on the achievements of ethnic minority pupils ISBN 0 - 11 - 350084 - X, London: HMSO. . Has a good section on ethnography.
- 5.16 *Henrietta:* The OFSTED report on The Teaching of Reading in 45 Inner London Primary Schools, ref. 27/96/DS, obtainable from OFSTED Publications Centre, P.O. Box 6927, LONDON E3 3NZ, phone 0171 510 0180
has been critically analysed in
MORTIMORE, P. and GOLDSTEIN, H. A Critical Examination of OFSTED Research ISBN 0 0854 735038, Available from The Institute of Education, University of London, price £5.

6. Committee Membership

6.1 We have invited George Keith and Brian Street to become co-opted members. They have agreed and will attend as soon as possible.

6.2 We agreed to invite Gunther Kress, Jenny Cheshire and Ron Carter, in that order, depending on our parent organisations agreeing to our inviting, and paying the travel expenses of, more than three co-opted members.

ACTION: - *Roz and Nicola to ask Chairpersons of LAGB and BAAL respectively for their agreement for us to do this.*

- *Nicola to invite accordingly.*

- *Discuss the financial implications as part of the Statement of accounts at the February meeting*

6.3 Peter Daw has left NAAE and begun work at OFSTED. We agreed to ask him to recommend a replacement as representative of NAAE and to continue attending in his new capacity.

ACTION: *Roz to write to Peter*

6.4 We should invite representatives of ALA, BSA, NATECLA and B Deaf A.

ACTION: *Roz to contact these organisations*

7. Proposed CLIE meetings at BAAL's AGM each September

7.1 Agreed to try this in Birmingham in Sept 1997 and in Manchester in Sept 1998. (see item 3 (53.6) above for ACTION)

7.2 Kersti also suggested we might occasionally meet at an LAGB meeting. We did not agree a specific date and location for this.

8. Provision of courses about language for the teaching of English Language A Level Discussion postponed for next meeting

9. Teacher Training Agency criteria for funding

We considered the use of such criteria to be an assault on academic freedom.

We agreed to try to find out more about this before deciding whether we should or could usefully take any action.

ACTION: - *All to find out if documentation about these criteria have reached our institutions.*

- *Nicola to ask Ros Mitchell for a copy of her draft response (and of the original document) for us to consider at a future meeting/*

10. Teacher Training Agency Consultations about KAL for Primary Teachers

We agreed to ask to be put on the TTA mailing list to receive future communication about the consultation process.

We thought it would be useful to send a response as part of the initial round of consultations, as CLIE can represent views which might otherwise be vetted within institutions.

We agreed to consult Alison Sealey and Chris Brumfit, both of whom have given thought to and/or written on this topic, as part of the process of drafting our response.

ACTION: - *Roz and Ali to draft a CLIE response; Roz then to circulate it for feedback from other members and Chris and Alison, and produce the final version.*
- *Roz to take overall responsibility for contacting and communicating with the TTA.*

11. **A.O.B.**

ACTION: *Nicola undertook to produce an updated list of committee members' names and addresses*

12. **Presentation by Ben Rampton:**

'Multilingualism in England: A review of the research'.

Ben provided copies of the paper he had written collaboratively with colleagues Roxy Harris and Constant Leung at the Centre for Applied Linguistic Research at TVU on this topic for the Annual Review of Applied Linguistics 17 (1997/98), and talked us through it.

A particularly interesting feature of the article is a discussion of the weaknesses in the arguments of academics in the 1980s

Ben presented a table identifying four orientations to cultural diversity in education. He concentrated on what they had called 'a discourse approach' to multilingualism in Britain in the 1990s, which included both

(i) critical discourse analysis of the way in which multilingualism is represented in documents such as the National Curriculum, and

(ii) studying how people negotiate their (multilingual) identities in discourse.

The article, which contains 17 key annotated and many more unannotated references, will be published in full in ARAL in the coming year, and there will be a summary in the next edition of the BAAL Newsletter.

Unfortunately there was not enough time for discussion of the issues in the paper: careful reading of it is highly recommended!

NOTE

1. Reprinted in CARTER, R. (ed.) 1982 *Linguistics and the Teacher*. London: R.K.P.