

**COMMITTEE FOR LINGUISTICS IN EDUCATION  
MINUTES OF MEETING 71**

**Wednesday 19<sup>th</sup> June 2002  
2.00-5.00 p.m.**

**at The Institute of Education, University of London**

**1. Welcomes, introductions and apologies for absence (RI)**

PRESENT: Sue Barry (LAGB, secretary), Keith Brown (LAGB), Keith Davidson (NATE), Charlotte Franson (NALDIC), Dick Hudson (LAGB), Roz Ivanic (BAAL, Chair), Constant Leung (BAAL)

APOLOGIES: Richard Aplin (ALA), Mary Auckland (RCSLT), Mike Baynham (BAAL), Deborah Cameron (Institute of Education), Celine Castelino (BSA), Sharon Curry (ALL), Ros Fisher (UKRA), Anthea Fraser Gupta (LAGB), Terry Lamb (ALL), Janet Maybin (BAAL), April McMahon (LAGB), Teresa O'Brien (BAAL), Marina Spiegel (NATECLA), Brian Street (Kings College)

RI welcomed Ann Rollinson (Honorary Treasurer of ALL), who was representing ALL at this meeting.

**2. Amendments to Minutes of Meeting 70 (RI)**

Item 3 (Matters arising):

5(b) should read:

Charlotte Franson cannot represent NAAE (National Association for Advisors in English) on CLIE, as was suggested at one time, but will continue to attend as NALDIC representative.

**3. Matters arising**

All the following are subsections of Item 3 (Matters Arising).

Item 5g (CLIE membership):

RI is continuing to search for a Mother Tongue Teaching representative for CLIE.

Item 6 (Communication with Laura Huxford):

(see also item 5 below)

RI invited LH to the discussion session of this meeting (19<sup>th</sup> June); Sue Pigeon (NLS) will attend this session.

RI is to meet with Laura Huxford (on 4/7/02).

*EAL within KS3 (CL):*

Guidelines are being developed within KS3 for writing further advisory material for the teaching of EAL. Val McGregor (NLS) is working with an Ethnic Minority Achievement Grant to develop training materials for teachers of EAL. She has met with NALDIC representatives; and is also working with DH on the materials. There is an EAL strand in the National Strategy for Key Stage 3 (NS KS3). Within the NS KS3 the English team is developing materials on language across the curriculum to assist the delivery of the National Curriculum. AR noted that the NS KS3 was concerned with improving the delivery of KS3 targets, not developing the curriculum.

KD noted that the Association for Science Teaching has developed literacy materials at primary level and are developing materials at secondary level.

DfES is to meet with a number of professional organisations to discuss EMAG (chaired by Baroness Ashton).

At the meeting between RI and Laura Huxford on 4/7/02, RI to offer to LH a meeting between CLIE and a member of the NLS team to discuss language issues in NS KS3. (See also item 5 below).

ACTION RI

CF to report back to CLIE at the next meeting on the discussions between NALDIC and NS KS3.

ACTION CF

*Grammar for Writing (DH):*

Two reviews of G4W have been published in *Syntax in the Schools* (vol 18, 2002): two more reviews are to come in this journal. Both reviews are favourable. Laura Huxford is interested in international reaction to British initiatives in literacy, and has given a positive response to these reviews.

#### **4. CLIE membership (RI)**

An update of the present membership was circulated; and will also be circulated by e-mail to members not present at the meeting.

ACTION SB

It was noted that RI has one more year as Chair and SB one more year as secretary; and that a new Chair would have to be appointed by June 2003 in order to shadow RI at that meeting. In line with CLIE's constitution, the new Chair will be an LAGB representative and the new secretary a BAAL representative.

It was reported that Brian Street had expressed doubts over whether he would be able to continue as a member of CLIE. It was hoped that he would be able to do so.

RI is to contact the British Dyslexia Association to arrange a replacement for Lindsay Peer.

ACTION RI

It was agreed to coopt Gunter Kress onto the committee, after it has been confirmed that it is in line with the CLIE constitution.

ACTION RI

#### **5. Communication with Laura Huxford (RI)**

(communication between RI and LH in agenda papers)

The committee commended the inclusion by RI in this communication of the list of expertise covered by CLIE's parent organisations.

A discussion followed as to what RI should take to the meeting with LH on 4/7/02. It was agreed that RI should suggest a workshop given by representatives of CLIE's member organisations on literacy at primary level; and also to offer assistance with the review of the National Literacy Strategy framework (forthcoming in the next 1-2 years).

RI is to report back to CLIE.

ACTION RI

## 6. The 14-19 Green Paper

The responses to this paper from BAAL and from LAGB, together with a report on this for NATE, are in the agenda papers. Attention was also directed to ALL's response, which is at: <http://www.all-languages.org.uk/>

DH noted that responses can still be sent on the accompanying paper *Language Learning* (which is at: <http://www.dfes.gov.uk/14-19greenpaper>). The address for responses is: Geoff Brown, DfES, G F, Caxton House, Tothill Street, London SW1H 9NA

KB noted that the LAGB's response included a suggestion that English Language be distinguished from English Literature, and that the proposals regarding 'English' in the Green Paper should refer to English Language only. KD reported that NATE would be unhappy to disassociate English Language and English Literature in this way. It was agreed that a consensus among CLIE member organisations on all matters would not be possible, thus precluding a joint response. It was agreed, however, to disseminate the responses amongst CLIE's constituent organisations; and that all organisations whose responses to the Green Paper are on the web to send the url to DH for inclusion as a link on CLIE's website.

ACTION: all

KD expressed concern at the increasing tendency, evident in the green paper, to define subject areas very narrowly.

There was also general concern that the "entitlement" to a modern foreign language risks being divisive in practice if not in intent.

## 7. Reports from representatives of organisations (All)

a. **NALDIC** (National Association for Language Development in the Curriculum):  
Two forthcoming events were announced:

- (i) Conference on *Developing EAL perspectives: NALDIC's next 10 years*: Nov 22-23 2002, London;
- (ii) Seminar on *EAL in Initial Teacher Training*, University of London Union, Tues Sept 10<sup>th</sup>, 2-5pm.

b. **RSaLT** (Royal College of Speech and Language Therapists):

Changes to national baseline screening are forthcoming. At present this is carried out 7 weeks after school entry. However, the evidence base for screening is sketchy and it has not shown up children with low level language problems who have difficulties with literacy at a later stage.

A foundation stage package is being developed now (CF): the baseline will be removed and literacy will be pushed to a later stage.

c. **LAGB** (Linguistics Association of Great Britain):

(i) The Education committee of the LAGB organised a Linguistics at School session at the LAGB spring meeting (EdgeHill, April 2002), on *Linguistics in Teacher Education*. The three speakers were Kate Ruttle (a teacher at Ditton Lodge First School, Newmarket with experience in the development of NLS materials), John Keen (University of Manchester School of Education), and Keith Brown (Research Centre for English and Applied Linguistics, University of Cambridge). A summary of this and previous Linguistics at School sessions can be seen at: <http://www/phon.ucl.ac.uk/home/dick/ec/ecsessions.htm>

(ii) At the forthcoming Autumn meeting at UMIST in September there will be a session on *Community Languages* (Wednesday September 18<sup>th</sup> 2-4).

(iii) the LAGB response to the 14-19 Green Paper can be seen at:

<http://www.ucl.phon.ac.uk/dick/home/ec/ectop.htm>

d. **BAAL** (British Association of Applied Linguists):

(i) The forthcoming conference was announced on *Applied Linguistics at the Interface* at University of Leeds, September 2003

(ii) There was a discussion of current attempts to enable access to academic journals by those working in 'information-poor' countries (Attachment 1)

e. **ALL** (Association for Language Learning)

(i) A conference on the 14-19 Green Paper was held in May, following which ALL's response was written by the response team.

(ii) The recent conference on *Building Bridges* (at the University of York in April ) discussed the transition stages between primary – secondary – tertiary levels.

f. **NATE** (National Association of Teachers of English):

It was reported that Alan Howe (Director of the English strand within Key Stage 3) is to address NATE in September

g. **UKRA** (United Kingdom Reading Association):

UKRA's report is given in Attachment 2 below.

## **8. Dates of future meetings and choice of speakers (RI)**

The following dates were agreed for meetings in the academic year 2002/3:

November 6<sup>th</sup> 2002

February 19<sup>th</sup> 2003

June 11<sup>th</sup> 2003

All are on Wednesday 2-5 pm.

The topic of the November meeting will be Education of the Deaf.

## **9. A.O.B.**

CL reported that the BBC were looking for a speaker for 9/7/02 to address the questions of (i) "Why we should not force speakers from linguistic minorities to speak English", and (ii) "Why we should learn a modern foreign language".

## **10. DISCUSSION: TEACHING SPEAKING AND LISTENING**

The discussion focussed on the QCA document 'Teaching speaking and listening in Key stages 1 and 2' (QCA 1999).

Sue Pigeon (Regional Director (London) for the NLS) joined the meeting for this discussion.

RI reported on current developments at the NLS and QCA on working to teach writing through listening and through dialogue at Key Stages 1 and 2. Sue Pigeon noted that the profile of speaking and listening is being raised within the NLS framework, with the publication of *Developing Early Writing* which develops materials on oral rehearsal as the way in to writing for Reception and Year 1 pupils.

RI reported on recent communication with Janet White at QCA:

- practitioner research groups: six groups of teachers are at present researching aspects of spoken language (e.g. deixis, ellipsis, clause structure) in their classrooms
- the QCA are keen to develop materials on a variety of topics (oral heritage; critical and aesthetic functions of talking; interpersonal relations in the classroom which are managed by talk) and would welcome research on these matters
- EAL: the QCA would like to investigate to what extent “a classroom rich in languages is rich in language learning”, and to identify the demands across the curriculum of EAL pupils
- QCA is organising a meeting (on 27/6/02) on New Perspectives on Spoken English, involving NALDIC, NATE, NAAE (National Association for Advisors of English), the English Association, UKRA and the National Association for Drama

DH suggested that we should offer 3-4 names for a meeting with QCA on these topics. The importance of the QCA being aware of the diversity of views on these topics was emphasised. For example, although the view is prevalent that conversation has a distinct grammar from formal writing, some researchers (for example Geoff Leech) argue that the differences affect specific areas of a single over-arching grammar (which also accommodates other varieties such as journalism, academic writing and novels). The presentation of different perspectives on the relationship between speaking and writing is therefore vital.

Sue Pigeon noted that the NLS framework excludes oracy at present, but efforts are starting to be made to pull out of the framework objectives and the units of work those which link more to speaking and listening than to writing.

The model of speaking underpinning the QCA document (*Teaching speaking and listening in Key stages 1 and 2*) was criticised by CL. It is above all a functional model, where participants talk in order to explain, classify, etc: functions which are also fulfilled by writing. The view of talk as an embodiment of social practice was absent.

The issue of progression in the model was seen as a problem (and one which the QCA would welcome research on). CL expressed the view that progression was determined only in terms of the content of the task rather than how successful the speaker was in achieving the aims set. In KD's view it was arbitrary which years particular tasks appeared in. KB suggested that different linguistic features (e.g. modality, reference tracking, complexity) could be found which would match progression.

KD noted the absence of how talk informs the learning process; and also expressed the concern that at certain points the use of Standard English appeared to be equated with 'clarity'.

CF expressed reservations that the tasks carried out in the classroom will be divided into 'oral' and 'non-oral' work, and oracy becomes another activity to be measured. Although this does not seem to be the intention behind the model of work laid out, the fact that the number of hours to be spent on oral work was specified meant that this is a possible outcome.

DH noted that in the writing materials there is a clear framework of ideas ranging from word level to sentence level and then to text level, whereas in speaking there is no such obvious framework available.

There was general agreement that if the framework proposed is lacking in clarity then this will obviously result in confusion on the part of teachers.

## **CLIE Meeting No. 71: 19<sup>th</sup> June 2002 Attachment 1**

### Agenda item 7d.

#### Report from BAAL (CL)

Recently some publishers in our fields of work , e.g. Oxford University Press, Multilingual Matters and Taylor Francis, have made some journals on their lists accessible on the Internet free of charge (or at a reduced rate) to economically developing and 'information-poor' countries. The publishers adopt the categories or definitions of 'developing' countries used by international development agencies, such as the UN Human Development Index.

This is a welcome development. However, the newly available Internet facility has raised further questions of accessibility. Access to the on-line journals for individual readers in these countries depends on whether the existence of appropriate telecommunications infrastructures and availability of PCs with the necessary software. Free (or nearly free) provision does not necessarily mean unrestricted access for the end users. This is an interesting issue. It would be good to hear from other CLIE-member associations to find out what efforts have been made to share information with colleagues working in 'information-poor' countries.

## CLIE Meeting No. 71: 19<sup>th</sup> June 2002 Attachment 2

Agenda item 7g.

Report from UKRA (RF)

### Conferences

Please see previous report or UKRA website [www.ukra.org](http://www.ukra.org) for details of the UKRA International Conference at Chester and IRA World Congress in Edinburgh, both in July this year.

### Books

Three new UKRA books are now in the final stages of production:

#### Minibook 14

#### **Developing Narrative Writing 7 – 13 by Roy Corden**

Throughout the 1990s Ofsted identified writing as an area in need of improvement. Statutory Programmes of Study have been established in England, Wales and Northern Ireland, and National Curriculum and Assessment Guidelines in Scotland. However, national assessment results for show that although there has been an improvement in children's reading attainments, achievement in writing remains a cause for concern, particularly with regard to boys. TRAWL (2000-2002) is a research project funded by The Nottingham Trent University and sponsored by the United Kingdom Reading Association. Key stage two teachers worked in schools, as research partners, to observe and record each other during focused literacy sessions and writing workshops. They met each week to discuss observations, evaluate recordings and analyse children's writing. Each teacher maintained a research portfolio and the research group met on a regular basis to discuss progress. The outcomes from this research are described in this book. Roy Corden covers all areas of the teaching of narrative writing with a particular focus on the links between reading and writing. The book is full of practical ideas and rich with examples from real classrooms. All teachers and student teachers working with children from 7 to 13 will find this book of interest and real value.

Price	Members £6
	Non members £7.50

#### Minibook 15

#### **Poetry Matters by Andrew Lambirth**

This is a book for teachers and student teachers looking for ways to energise their work with poetry in their classrooms. It sets out to help practitioners realise their own poetic potential and existing knowledge of poetry and rhyme. The book provides dynamic ideas and activities that put power back into poetics. Reading, performing, discussing, showing, writing, drawing – its all here to make poetry matter for teachers and children.

Price	Members £5
	Non members £6.50

#### **A collection of papers on writing in the primary school:**

#### **Connecting Creativity: New ideas in teaching writing edited by Sue Ellis and Colin Mills**

*Connecting, Creating: New ideas in teaching writing* is a fascinating collection of papers on the important topic of teaching children to write. It provides an excellent mix of contributions written by lecturers in teacher education, consultants and by classroom teachers. Chapters describe classroom projects that have taken place in England and in Scotland, emphasising the shared concerns of primary teachers. Throughout the central concerns of the importance of providing rich experiences for children and the integration of reading, writing, speaking and listening in the teaching of writing shine through.

The book is organised in three parts, each with an interlinking theme to guide your reading and thinking. Each part provides case study material, a discussion of teaching strategies and theoretical insight.

Part One: Naming Worlds, Hearing Voices

The link between writing and oral language is complex. This section shows how, working from the first principles of engaging with children's play, everyday interests, contexts and storytelling, can give teachers valuable and potentially strong starting points for their development as writers.

Part Two: Thinking Like a Writer

Thinking like a writer involves the confident, conscious crafting of text. These chapters explore exactly what that means for teachers in terms of their classroom practice and what it means for children in terms of how they think and come to know about writing.

**Part Three: Knowing and Doing:**

This part considers how some of the kinds of knowledge that we need as teachers can be powerfully used to help children as writers, how children can be helped to understand how texts work and how grammar functions in writing. We look at some accounts of what effective teachers do, and what they think about what they do. The final chapter is a powerful illustration of how the 'connecting, processing and transforming' powers of writing could be harnessed to a literacy hour format.

Price  
Members £9.50  
Non members £11.50

And, towards the end of term, a collection of papers on teaching phonics:

**Perspectives in the Teaching and Learning of Phonics** edited by Margaret Cook  
with papers by Greg Brooks, Henrietta Dombey, Usha Goswami, Jane Medwell and Nicholas Bielby

Proposed price  
Members £7  
Non members £8

**Available from the UKRA Publications Department,  
Tel: 01763 241188, Fax: 01763 243785**